Options Assessment
Turnstiles Building – Randwick Racecourse
CBD and South East Light Rail
Alison Road Turnstiles Building, Royal Randwick Racecourse
Heritage Options Analysis, November 2015

1.0 Background
The CBD and South East Light Rail (CSELR) will comprise the construction and operation of a new light rail service from Circular Quay to Central Station, then to Kingsford and Randwick, via Surry Hills and Moore Park. The project has been approved as a State Significant Infrastructure (SSI) project (SSI–6402). GML Heritage Pty Ltd (GML) prepared a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) to accompany the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) for the project, as well as a number of supplementary reports to address changes in the design.

The purpose of this report is to analyse options around the future of the Alison Road Turnstiles building within the Royal Randwick Racecourse. The Ministers Conditions of Approval (MCoA), specifically Condition B60, for the CSELR states that a report analysing the options for retention of the Turnstiles building should be prepared.

B. 60 Prior to construction of works on the Royal Randwick Racecourse site affecting the wall associated with Royal Randwick Racecourse, adjacent to Alison Road and east of Darley Road, or the former entrance gatehouse building, the Proponent shall prepare a report to the satisfaction of the Secretary investigating options for the retention of these buildings/structures, including relocation within the racecourse grounds. The report shall clearly describe the impacts of each option considered and likely future heritage value of these buildings in the context of the Randwick Racecourse Conservation Area.

As a result of the detailed design process the track alignment has been further refined and now avoids all impacts to the Swab building and heritage significant elements of the boundary walls adjacent to Alison Road and east of Darley Road which were impacted in earlier design iterations. Therefore, as the impacts to the boundary walls adjacent to Alison Road and east of Darley Road do not impact heritage fabric this report specifically addresses options relating to the Turnstiles building (ie ‘the former entrance gatehouse building’) only, as required by the MCoA.

In preparing this report, a series of options have been developed by Acciona in collaboration with GML that seek to avoid or minimise the physical impacts, and to provide practicable options to conserve the heritage significance of the Turnstiles building in an appropriate setting by either in situ retention or relocation. The report also takes into consideration other development approvals for the immediately adjacent land.
2.0 Site Identification

The Turnstiles building is located on the northern boundary of the Royal Randwick Racecourse on Alison Road, immediately east of the intersection of Alison and Darley Roads (see Figure 1).

![Figure 1](image1.png)

3.0 Historical Outline

Primary historical research has not been undertaken to inform this analysis, however, the draft Specific Element Conservation Policy (SECP) for the Alison Road Boundary Precinct, Royal Randwick Racecourse (Godden Mackay Logan, 2007) provides the following outline history for the Turnstiles building (Gate 6):

> Although the 1880 tramway extension improved public access to the racecourse site, the position of the station on the opposite side of Alison Road to the racecourse and the relatively small size of the platform meant that, by 1900, the system was struggling to cope with the increasing crowds. As a result, the decision was made to construct a dedicated tram station within the racecourse site. In order to accommodate the tramlines and associated infrastructure, an area that originally formed part of Centennial Park to the northwest of the racecourse site was added to the racecourse land through a series of grants and permissive occupancies to the AJC [Australian Jockey Club] and Commissioner of Railways (known today as the State Transit Authority). The extra land extended the original 1840 northern boundary of the racecourse reserve and the 1863 northern boundary of the racecourse site along Alison Road to the corner of Doncaster Avenue (see Figure 2.3). As a result, the entire northern boundary of the racecourse site became aligned with Alison Road from Doncaster Avenue to Wansey Road.

> The construction of the tramway and associated infrastructure in 1900 also resulted in the construction of a new main entrance and gatehouse. Known today as the Members’ Entrance (Gate 1), the new main entrance is situated on the northern boundary of the racecourse site, within the land that once formed part of Centennial Park.
The first turnstile building on Alison Road (known today as Gate 4) was constructed in 1911. This date correlates with the decision made by the AJC in 1910 to cease auctioning the rights to collect entrance fees at the gates and to begin collecting entrance fees themselves. An additional turnstile building was constructed c1917 (known today as Gate 6).

4.0 Description

An inspection of the exterior of the Turnstiles building was undertaken on 21 August by Senior Heritage Consultant of GML, facilitated by Acciona.

The former Turnstiles Building at Gate 6 is part of the Alison Road Boundary precinct. The former Turnstiles building is a set of two brick buildings symmetrically arranged around a central entrance gate. The building comprised ticket booths and turnstile entryways which have been infilled, although its original form and fabric are easily identifiable. The detailing of the Alison Road elevation is restrained with recessed brickwork detailing and double header segmental arches over all openings. The parapet is detailed with a horizontal band of sandstone. The sills of the ticket windows are also constructed in sandstone.

The condition of the building is fair to poor with the brick work and sandstone experiencing varying levels of deterioration. There is also some organic growth in the brickwork of the Alison Road elevation.

Figure 2 General view of the western half of the former Turnstiles building showing the window tickets and entryways. (Source: GML 2015)

Figure 3 General view of the eastern half of the former Turnstiles building. The central gate between the two separate buildings can be seen here. (Source: GML 2015)
5.0 Heritage Significance

The Turnstiles Building is located within the Royal Randwick Racecourse Heritage Conservation Area listed on the Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012, item no. C13.

Existing Assessments

The 2006 Draft CMP for Royal Randwick Racecourse assigned relative levels of significance to the individual components of the racecourse site, including the former Turnstiles building (Gate 6). The rankings of significance are carried over in the site specific Randwick Council Development Control Plan for the site (Randwick Council DCP 2013, Section E3). The relevant components and their identified level of significance are identified in the table below.

Table 1 Existing assessments of the Royal Randwick Racecourse and the former Turnstiles building.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone or Element</th>
<th>Level of Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Royal Randwick Racecourse</td>
<td>Exceptional Significance (State level)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turnstiles building (Gate 6)</td>
<td>High Significance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.0 Discussion of Significance

The former Turnstiles building has historic significance for its long term use as an entrance to the site and provides evidence of the AJC reclaiming control over site access from 1910. It contributes to the aesthetic qualities of the Alison Road boundary wall and demonstrates the historical evolution of the Alison Road boundary of the racecourse site. The entrance gates provide physical evidence of the historic association of the racecourse site with the AJC.
7.0 Consideration of Design Alternatives

The intersection on the corner of Alison and Darley Roads is highly constrained owing to the very limited availability of land to undertake construction and operation of the light rail whilst achieving traffic and pedestrian performance requirements. During the detail design process the track alignment has been refined to accommodate the traffic and shared path requirements on Alison Road and has avoided the impact to the Royal Randwick Racecourse Swab building, which was previously proposed to be demolished. However, these constraints have resulted in the track alignment encroaching on the footprint of the former Turnstiles building. The physical impact of the realignment will be demolition of the former Turnstiles Building, and therefore options for the future of the building need to be considered.

8.0 Options Analysis

There are a number of options available to address the issues resulting from the location of the former Turnstiles building within the footprint of the CSELR project.

The heritage significance of the former Turnstiles building is largely derived from its original use and its relationship with Alison Road and the boundary of the Royal Randwick Racecourse. Therefore, in heritage terms it is vital that any future option for the former Turnstiles building provides a strong connection with the formal entrances to the racecourse on Alison Road and ease of public access and interpretation.

The following analysis considers the available possibilities. The options are not mutually exclusive, and a number of the options might be implemented.

8.1 Retention and Conservation of the Entire Building in Current Location

Partial retention and conservation of the entire former Turnstiles building in the current location may be possible. However, based on GML's understanding of the performance requirements for the construction and operation of the CSELR in this area, a viable option that retains the former Turnstiles building while meeting the project requirements with regard to traffic and pedestrian egress is not available without substantial re-design (ie a different route for the CSELR to Randwick).

This option (if it were possible) would result in a neutral heritage impact. There would be no change to the current 'High' heritage value of the building.

8.2 Partial Retention in Current Location

Partial retention and conservation of the former Turnstiles building in the current location may be physically possible, but would still require some redesign of the route. Furthermore, owing to the symmetrical arrangement and detailing of the two structures which comprise the former Turnstiles building, partial demolition of one or both structures will have a substantial impact on the architectural composition of the building, and therefore on the aesthetic heritage values of the building. This would be a major adverse impact on its heritage significance, and further add to the cumulative heritage impact on the Royal Randwick Racecourse Heritage Conservation Area.

8.3 Relocation on the Boundary of the Royal Randwick Racecourse

Consideration has been given to the possible relocation of the former Turnstiles building along the boundary of the Royal Randwick Racecourse. The following relocation options have been considered with respect to heritage impacts and the likely residual significance of the building. The relocation options are based on the assumption that the building can be physically relocated and reassembled. Relocation
would also allow for conservation work to be undertaken on the structure. However, irrespective of the merits or otherwise of relocating the former Turnstiles building, in practical terms relocation of a masonry building such as this will require demolition and reconstruction. The process would inevitably diminish the patina of age that has accrued in the fabric of the building, and further reduce its integrity as a heritage structure. This impact would be applicable to any relocation option.

8.3.1 Gate 6—Alison Road—Current Location along Amended Boundary Alignment
This location is approximately 5 metres south of the current location of the former Turnstiles building along the alignment of the new Royal Randwick Racecourse boundary. As this location is close to the current location, the impact on the structure and on the Royal Randwick Racecourse Heritage Conservation Area would be minimised. The building would continue to form part of the edge to the racecourse and aligns with the existing hierarchy of fencing around the boundary of the racecourse. This option would require an existing approved Development Application by the Australian Turf Club for a hotel complex in this location to be modified to accommodate the relocated gates.

8.3.2 Gate 7A—Alison Road
This location would be in the future position of Gate 7A, located further east along Alison Road. The two individual structures that comprise the former Turnstiles building would need to be relocated at a new spacing (much wider) to accommodate the access requirements of the gate while reinstating the buildings. The required configuration would substantially change the physical relationship of the two structures. Further to this, the substantial brick structures would be located in an area that has historically had a much simpler fencing style. Relocation to this extent would have a moderate adverse impact on the building, and further add to the cumulative heritage impact on the Royal Randwick Racecourse Heritage Conservation Area. The residual significance of the building would be greatly reduced. The location would also require the removal of a number of significant fig trees along the northern edge of the racecourse. Relocation and reconfiguration of the building so far from its historical location would have a major adverse impact on its heritage significance.

8.3.3 Gate 10—Wansey Road
This location would be in the current position of Gate 10, located along Wansey Road. As for the Gate 7A option, the two individual structures that comprise the former Turnstiles building would need to be relocated at a new spacing to accommodate the access requirements of the gate while reinstating the buildings. Historically this section of the racecourse has had a much simpler fencing style and would be an inaccurate representation of the development of the racecourse. Relocation and reconfiguration of the building so far from its historical location would have a major adverse impact on its heritage significance.

8.4 Relocation within the Royal Randwick Racecourse
A location within the Racecourse (ie not along the boundary) would not retain or enhance the heritage significance of the former Turnstiles building. The residual significance of the building would be severely undermined. Relocation within the racecourse also has the potential to impact on other heritage components within the precinct and be an inaccurate historical representation of the racecourses development.

8.5 Demolition
For the reasons noted above, the action of relocating the building will have substantial adverse heritage impacts on the integrity of the fabric of the building, the loss of its original setting, and its ability to demonstrate the physical development of the racecourse. Despite the High heritage significance of the
former Turnstiles building, demolition is an option if other preferred options are not appropriate. Demolition would be a major adverse impact on the heritage significance on the former Turnstiles building and further add to the cumulative heritage impact on the Royal Randwick Racecourse Heritage Conservation Area. However, demolition would avoid historical misrepresentations that are likely to come about through relocating the building to incompatible locations for the sake of retaining the fabric of the building (eg Gate 7A, 10 and other locations within the racecourse).

8.6 Archival Recording
Prior to, and in conjunction with, either relocation or demolition it is essential to undertake comprehensive archival recording. This would involve recording the fabric of the site itself through digital processes. Archival recording is not an end in itself, but is an essential mitigative action prior to any change and a useful resource for future interpretation of the site.

8.7 Interpretation
The level of impact will determine the required level of heritage interpretation for the former Turnstiles building. Options for effective interpretive devices and media—whether on or off site (or both)—will need to be determined in consultation with the landscape plan for the current site of the former Turnstiles building. The interpretation should be innovative and may for instance reflect a silhouette of the building but must present and communicate the history and heritage significance of the place. While also not an end in itself, an effective interpretation plan and implementation may assist in achieving consent for both immediate and long term outcomes for the site.

9.0 Recommendations
Given the relative level of significance of the former Turnstiles building within the Royal Randwick Racecourse (high significance) Option 8.1 (Retention and Conservation of the Entire Building in Current Location) which would retain the building in its current location, and would be the preferred heritage option, has been explored and it has been determined that this option is not viable without substantial re-design (ie a different route for the CSELR to Randwick).

In terms of the relocation options analysed (Options 8.3–8.4), the Gate 6 option (Option 8.3.1) (current location, but moved south to align with the new Royal Randwick Racecourse boundary) is the only relocation option that could be supported on heritage grounds. The other proposed locations are not appropriate for the reasons stated above and would result in heritage impacts elsewhere whilst leaving little residual significance in the structure itself.

If the former Turnstiles building could be relocated at Gate 6, taking into account the operational requirements of the CSELR and Royal Randwick Racecourse, there is a risk that the building will be physically and/or visually impacted upon as part of the new hotel development proposed within ATC land in the short to medium term. Further to this there is no ongoing use of the structure as an entry point to the racecourse and no known proposal to reinstate or activate this building. Furthermore, in practical terms relocation would require demolition and reconstruction of the building, with the consequent loss of the patina of age that the building has accrued since its construction. On the basis that Option 8.1 is not viable, the preferred heritage outcome is, demolition subject to strict archival recording and innovative interpretation integrated in the landscape planning and fencing for ATC. Based on this analysis demolition will have the least adverse outcome in terms of maintaining the integrity of the racecourse and avoiding the creation of inaccurate representations of the development of the racecourse. The process of
relocation would mean demolition and reconstruction losing all patina, resulting in a substantially new building with no proposed functional use.

If demolition (Option 8.5) of former Turnstiles building is pursued appropriate adjustments to the project approval may be required. The demolition would need to be assessed to formalise the level of heritage impact in a supplementary Heritage Impact Assessment for the zone prior to the work being undertaken. As a preliminary assessment, demolition of the former Turnstiles building would be a major heritage impact (as defined in the HIA, GML 2013). This preliminary assessment of heritage impact is consistent with that of other elements within the Royal Randwick Racecourse that are approved for demolition.